Appendix B
CMET Scoring Guide v3

Question	*Scoring Commentary*
Your name:	
Material set analyzed:	Include name and URL of the website, as well as the title of the specific lessons or units analyzed.
Date(s) of analysis:	The beginning and ending date when analysis was conducted
This tool begins and ends with your overall impressions of the material set. In between, it prompts you to assess along four dimensions—*inquiry approach*, *critical orientation*, *teacher agency*, and *digital affordances*—which can be completed in any order.	
Part 1: Initial Impressions	
1. What do you find interesting about this material set? What stands out to you as unique, praiseworthy, or problematic?	Share your impressions in the box or through margin notes on the material set.
Part II: Inquiry Approach These questions refer to the *kinds of student activity* that the material set promotes.	
2. What is this material set mainly about (e.g., topics or eras)? What forms of inquiry does it emphasize (e.g., ingest information, interpret documents, cast moral judgments, etc.)? *(Justify your answer)*	Answer both parts of the prompt. For the second part, identify what students are being asked to do—i.e., the kinds of thinking they are asked to engage in. Consider peripheral or lead-up activities in relation to the central activities they support (e.g., reading comprehension questions as preparation for a moot court simulation). You may consider the full website when answering this question.
3. Given your answer to #2, what underlying assumptions (about history, power, education, etc.) appear to drive this material set? What is presented as given, and what is opened up to interrogate?	Answer both parts of the prompt.

4. Rate the material set on the following criteria:	No evidence 0	Some evidence 1	Substantial evidence 2

4a. Open-endedness: Centers compelling questions that have no obvious right answer (e.g., "should" or "why" questions).	Nearly all questions posed imply a correct answer; OR Information presented is too one-sided for the questions to be truly open; OR No questions posed.	Some of the central questions posed have no obvious right answer; AND In most of these cases, the information presented allows for multiple possible answers.	Nearly all central questions posed have no obvious right answer; AND In all of these cases, the information presented allows for multiple possible answers.
4b. Student Agency: Positions students as decisions-makers and authors of ideas, throughout all phases of inquiry.	Most material is laid out for students to memorize or assimilate. OR Students lack opportunities to contribute their own ideas.	Students make decisions about some things but not others (e.g., answer an open-ended question about a given set of sources, but without input into what the question or the sources are). AND Students are often recognized as authors of ideas.	Students make consequential decisions throughout all phases of inquiry. AND Students are consistently recognized as authors of ideas.

4c. Corroboration: Promotes comparison across multiple and disparate viewpoints on the events or issues examined.	Rarely presents more than one viewpoint on the topics addressed.	Presents multiple viewpoints, BUT does not actively promote or scaffold comparison across them.	Presents multiple viewpoints AND actively promotes or scaffolds comparison across them.

4d. Sourcing: Promotes consideration of the author's knowledge, bias, identity, intended audience, or purpose when interpreting sources or perspectives.	Provides no information on the origin and purpose of the source materials provided; OR Provides a citation (e.g., author–date–publication) as the only source information. OR Presents source material as authoritative, regardless of its origin.	Provides information on the origin and purpose of the source materials provided, BUT does not actively promote or scaffold the use of this information.	Provides information on the origin and purpose of the source materials provided AND actively promotes or scaffolds the use of this information when interpreting them.
4e. Contextualization: Promotes viewing events within their specific context (e.g., temporal, geographic, cultural).	Does not provide the background information necessary for students to view events within their specific context; OR Asks students to interpret or judge events out-of-context.	Provides background information that allows students to view events within their specific context to some extent, BUT does not actively promote or scaffold the use of this information.	Provides background information that allows students to view events thoroughly within their specific context, AND actively promotes or scaffolds the use of this information.

4f. Substantive Conversation: Promotes extended, substantive conversation among students over subject matter. "Substantive conversation" refers to students talking with each other about subject matter for more than 10 minutes.	Provides no opportunities for students to engage in extended, substantive conversation with peers over subject matter.	Provides opportunities for students to engage in extended, substantive conversation with peers over subject matter, BUT does not actively promote or scaffold such discussion.	Actively promotes or scaffolds extended, substantive conversation among students over subject matter; AND Allocates sufficient time for such discussion to occur.

4g. Sustained Inquiry: Promotes sustained (multiday) exploration of essential concepts, patterns, or trends (e.g., progress, colonialism). A "multiday exploration" spans at least three class periods.	Each lesson is primarily self-contained; OR Focus is on specific people or events, rather than larger concepts, patterns, or trends.	The content included could allow for sustained (multiday) exploration of essential concepts, patterns, or trends, BUT the material set does not explicitly promote or scaffold such sustained exploration.	Explicitly promotes or scaffolds sustained (multiday) exploration of essential concepts, patterns, or trends— typically by linking together daily lessons into a larger thematic unit.

Comments on your ratings:	As appropriate, note specific observations that led to your ratings (e.g., quotes from the curriculum, or links to specific passages). Also note hedges or uncertainties, or further questions you have.
Part III: Critical Orientation These questions refer to both the *substantive content* of the material set, and to the *kinds of student activity* it promotes.	
5. In this material set, who is at the center of the story (and who is at the periphery or missing)? Whose worldviews are being substantiated? *(Justify your answer)*	Answer all parts of the prompt.

6. For whom does this material set appear to be designed? (Consider, e.g., race, gender, ability, etc.) What assumptions are made about who the students and teacher are? *(Justify your answer)*	Answer both parts of the prompt. Also consider what background/cultural knowledge the materials assume students bring to the table.

7. Rate the material set on the following criteria:	No evidence 0	Some evidence 1	Substantial evidence 2

7a. Relevance: Inquiry is sparked by students' genuine interests, uncertainties, or experiences, or by issues relevant to our world.	Content does not appear relevant to students or to our present world; OR Content remains rooted in the past, with no connections drawn to the present.	Content could be relevant to students or to our present world, BUT the material set does not make such links between past and present explicit.	Directly links the historical content covered to students' lives or to issues relevant today; OR Students' genuine interests, uncertainties, or experiences provide the impetus for study.
7b. Culturally Sustaining Pedagogy (CSP): Centers and sustains the lifeways, stories, and traditions of communities often depicted at the margin or ignored. To "sustain" could involve, e.g., recognizing acts of resistance or celebrations of culture/identity.	Rarely or never centers the lifeways, stories, and traditions of communities often depicted at the margin or ignored.	Sometimes centers the lifeways, stories, and traditions of communities often depicted at the margin or ignored; BUT might not help sustain these.	Consistently centers AND sustains the lifeways, stories, and traditions of communities often depicted at the margin or ignored.
7c. Depictions: Presents people and events in an accurate, non-essentialized manner, avoiding stereotypes, exoticism, etc. To "essentialize" means to ascribe a common attribute to all members of a group, or to reduce a topic to a simple dichotomy (e.g., race as encompassing only "black" and "white").	Presents people or events in an inaccurate, essentialized, stereotypical, or exoticized way.	Usually presents people and events in an accurate manner, avoiding stereotypes, exoticism, etc. BUT may essentialize some topics, people, or events.	Consistently presents people and events in an accurate manner, avoiding stereotypes, exoticism, etc. AND avoids essentializing topics, people, or events.
7d. Agency: Depicts diverse groups as having agency (e.g., deciding, inventing, producing, resisting, etc.). "Diverse groups" comprises communities often depicted at the margin or ignored, as well as communities in more dominant positions.	Rarely depicts diverse groups as having agency; OR Depicts only dominant groups as having agency.	Usually depicts diverse groups as having agency to make decisions, invent or produce things, resist oppression, organize for change, etc.	Consistently depicts diverse groups as having agency to make decisions, invent or produce things, resist oppression, organize for change, etc.

7e. Critical Analysis: Promotes use of critical lenses (e.g., feminism, CRT) to analyze systems of oppression (not just individual acts). The material set need not explicitly name the critical lens used (e.g., CRT).	Does not promote use of critical lenses to analyze systems of oppression; OR Consistently treats racism, sexism, etc., as an individual pathology or as a thing of the past.	Sometimes promotes use of critical lenses to analyze systems of oppression and their root causes; AND Tends to avoid treating racism, sexism, etc., as an individual pathology or as a thing of the past.	Consistently promotes use of critical lenses to analyze systems of oppression and their root causes; AND Consistently avoids treating racism, sexism, etc., as an individual pathology or as a thing of the past.
7f. Social Action: Encourages students to act on their conclusions beyond the classroom (e.g., advocacy, organizing).	Does not encourage students to act on their conclusions beyond the classroom.	Sometimes encourages students to act on their conclusions beyond the classroom; OR Makes this optional or for extra credit; AND Possible actions might not be clearly delineated.	Encourages students to act on their conclusions beyond the classroom; AND Treats this as integral to the activity; AND Helps students delineate specific actions they could take.

Comments on your ratings:	As appropriate, note specific observations that led to your ratings (e.g., quotes from the curriculum, or links to specific passages). Also note hedges or uncertainties, or further questions you have.
Part IV: Teacher Agency and Pedagogical Supports These questions refer to the *pedagogical supports* that the material set provides for teachers.	
8. How are teachers positioned in this material set (e.g., as automatons, as decision-makers, as learners)? What instructional and planning decisions are prescribed and what is left open? What pedagogical supports are provided (and what is *not* provided)? *(Justify your answer)*	Answer all parts of the prompt. Are teachers expected to enact the lessons as is, or to make meaningful pedagogical decisions (e.g., regarding sequencing, scaffolding, etc.)? Does the material set fit the needs of both novice and experienced teachers?

9. Rate the material set on the following criteria:	No evidence 0	Some evidence 1	Substantial evidence 2
9a. Transparency of Design: Explains and justifies key design features and how to enact them (e.g., through call-out boxes). "Key design features" refers to the central, defining attributes of the material set.	Does not explain or justifies key design features or how to enact them in the classroom; OR Overarching pedagogical philosophy is not made explicit.	Points out some key design features and briefly explains how to enact them in the classroom, BUT might not provide a rationale for doing so; AND Overarching pedagogical philosophy might not be explicit.	Points out key design features, explains how to enact them in the classroom, AND provides a rationale for doing so; AND Overarching pedagogical philosophy is made explicit.

9b. Preconceptions: Describes potential student preconceptions (or misconceptions) and how they might be addressed.	Does not describe potential student preconceptions or misconceptions; OR Only defines unfamiliar vocabulary.	Describes potential student preconceptions or misconceptions; BUT Might not list strategies for determining if students hold these; AND Might not explain how these could be built upon or addressed.	Describes potential student preconceptions or misconceptions; AND Outlines strategies for determining if students hold these; AND Explains how these could be built upon or addressed.
9c. Adaptability to Local Context: Supports teachers' decision-making to fit varied contexts and professional needs (as opposed to prescribing what is to be done).	Does not acknowledge or support teachers' local decision-making; OR Prescribes exactly what is to be done.	Provides limited support for teachers' local decision-making (e.g., about the selection and ordering of activities).	Provides extensive support for teachers' local decision-making; AND Encourages reflection on how the local context might affect how key design elements get implemented.

9d. Accessibility (Universal Design): Allows students multiple means of engagement, representation, action, and expression. Consider the accessibility of the provided materials (e.g., vocabulary, font size, layout, etc.), as well as the diversity of student activities or lack thereof.	Does not allow for multiple means of engagement, representation, action, or expression; OR "One size fits all" curriculum.	Accounts for some diversity in learning strengths and needs, BUT may rely heavily on one central pedagogical approach.	Accounts for diversity in learning strengths and needs; AND Allows students multiple means of engagement, representation, action, and expression

9e. Differentiated Instruction: Specifies supports and extensions for English language learners, struggling readers, gifted students, or other students with specific learning needs.	Does not specify supports or extensions for students with specific learning needs; OR Only defines vocabulary as the exclusive support.	Specifies some supports or extensions for students with specific learning needs (e.g., readings at different levels).	Specifies extensive and varied supports and extensions for students with specific learning needs (e.g., readings in multiple languages, audio-visual aids, extension activities).
9f. Support for CSP: Supports teachers in developing culturally sustaining pedagogy (e.g., suggestions for facilitating discussions on sensitive topics, considering student demographics & identities). "Culturally sustaining pedagogy" (CSP) refers to centering and sustaining the lifeways, stories, and traditions of communities often depicted at the margin or ignored.	Assumes that the identities of students need not affect delivery of instruction. OR Provides no supports for teachers to develop CSP; OR Assumes a classroom of students only from dominant groups.	Acknowledges that identities of students affect delivery of instruction; AND Provides limited supports for teachers to develop CSP (e.g., suggestions for facilitating discussions on sensitive topics).	Acknowledges that identities of students affect delivery of instruction; AND Provides extensive supports for teachers to develop CSP (e.g., suggestions for tapping the cultural resources of BIPOC students).

9g. Assessments: Includes formative and summative assessments, along with advice for scoring or providing feedback (e.g., rubrics). An "assessment" is anything that creates a tangible record of the extent to which students have achieved the central learning objectives (e.g., written prompts on a worksheet; discussion participation tally sheet).	Does not include formative or summative assessments. OR Included assessments that would not indicate whether students have achieved the central learning objectives.	Includes formative or summative assessments, BUT without offering advice for scoring or providing feedback.	Includes formative and summative assessments; AND Offers advice for scoring or providing feedback to students (e.g., rubrics).
Comments on your ratings:	As appropriate, note specific observations that led to your ratings (e.g., quotes from the curriculum, or links to specific passages). Also note hedges or uncertainties, or further questions you have.		
Part V: Digital Affordances These questions refer to the *digital features* of the material set and hosting website.			
10. In what ways does the material set capitalize on the digital format?	Consider unique features that the digital format allows, beyond what a printed material could offer.		
11. Rate the material set on the following criteria:	No evidence 0	Some evidence 1	Substantial evidence 2
11a. Layout and Navigability: Website or material set is clearly laid out and easy for educators to navigate. When scoring, consider the full website in addition to the focus lessons.	Layout of website is confusing, disorganized, or cluttered, making it frustratingly difficult to navigate.	Layout of website is comprehensible BUT not terribly intuitive, making it somewhat easy to navigate	Layout of website is comprehensible, intuitive, AND free of clutter, making it easy to navigate.
11b. Search Functionality: Provides keyword or other search functions that allow users to easily locate desired content. When scoring, consider the full website in addition to the focus lessons.	Website contains no search function.	Website contains a basic search function to locate desired materials in a singular way (e.g., by time period).	Website contains advanced search functions to locate desired materials in multiple ways (e.g., by topic, date, grade level, etc.)

11c. Student Friendliness: Portions intended for student use fit that purpose well (e.g., visually appealing, not overwhelming, minimal distractions).	No portions of the website are well designed for student use.	Portions of the website are designed for student use, BUT contain some degree of clutter or distractions OR may not be visually appealing to students.	Portions of the website intended for student use fit that purpose well (e.g., visually appealing, not overwhelming, minimal distractions).

11d. Digital Information Sources: Includes multimedia, wikis, webpages, or other information sources not generally available in print.	Includes no information sources not generally available in print (e.g., uses only pictures and text).	Includes a few information sources not generally available in print, BUT most of the sources would be.	Includes extensive multimedia, wikis, webpages, or other information sources not generally available in print.
11e. Digital Collaboration: Provides a digital means for students to collaborate and/or build communal knowledge (e.g., threaded discussion, class wiki, Google docs).	Does not provide a digital means for students to collaborate or build communal knowledge.	Provides a digital means for students to collaborate and/or build communal knowledge, BUT does not actively promote or scaffold its use.	Provides a digital means for students to collaborate and/or build communal knowledge, AND actively promotes or scaffolds its use.
11f. Digital Scaffolding: Supports student thinking via digital scaffolds (e.g., templates, sentence starters, modeling, tutoring).	Provided scaffolds do not effectively support student thinking; OR No scaffolds provided.	Supports student thinking primarily via scaffolds that may not fully capitalize on the digital medium (e.g., graphic organizers; sentence starters).	Supports student thinking primarily via scaffolds that fully capitalize on the digital medium (e.g., hotlinks to hints or explanations; machine tutoring).

Comments on your ratings:	As appropriate, note specific observations that led to your ratings (e.g., quotes from the curriculum, or links to specific passages). Also note hedges or uncertainties, or further questions you have.

Part VI: Final Thoughts	
12. Have you used this material set? What for? What parts of it did you use? How did it work? (If you haven't used it, would you? Why or why not? What would you use it for?)	Answer all parts of the prompt.
13. How might you fit this material set to your goals and context (e.g., what might you change)?	Would you use it as is, or make changes—e.g., reorder readings or activities, drop some, add others, add supports, change language or vocabulary, etc.? *Justify your answer.*
14. Anything else about the material set not yet addressed?	